

State Bar Court of California Hearing Department Los Angeles

Counsel For The State Bar

Kimberly G. Anderson The State Bar of California Office of the Chief Trial Counsel 1149 S. Hill St. Los Angeles, CA 90015

Bar # 150359

Counsel For Respondent

Ellen A. Pansky
Pansky Markle Ham, LLP
1010 Sycamore Ave., Suite 1997 308
South Pasadena, CA 91030

Bar # 77688

In the Matter Of: Chrystal L. Bobbitt

Bar # 218544

A Member of the State Bar of California (Respondent)

Case Number (s) 07-0-12290

(for Court's use)

FILED

SEP 14 2009

STATE BAR COURT CLERK'S OFFICE LOS ANGELES

PUBLIC MATTER

Submitted to: Settlement Judge

STIPULATION RE FACTS, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND DISPOSITION AND ORDER APPROVING

STAYED SUSPENSION: NO ACTUAL SUSPENSION

☐ PREVIOUS STIPULATION REJECTED

Note: All information required by this form and any additional information which cannot be provided in the space provided, must be set forth in an attachment to this stipulation under specific headings, e.g., "Facts," "Dismissals," "Conclusions of Law," "Supporting Authority," etc.

A. Parties' Acknowledgments:

- (1) Respondent is a member of the State Bar of California, admitted **December 3, 2001**.
- (2) The parties agree to be bound by the factual stipulations contained herein even if conclusions of law or disposition are rejected or changed by the Supreme Court.
- (3) All investigations or proceedings listed by case number in the caption of this stipulation are entirely resolved by this stipulation and are deemed consolidated. Dismissed charge(s)/count(s) are listed under "Dismissals." The stipulation consists of **12** pages, not including the order.
- (4) A statement of acts or omissions acknowledged by Respondent as cause or causes for discipline is included under "Facts."
- (5) Conclusions of law, drawn from and specifically referring to the facts are also included under "Conclusions of Law".
- (6) The parties must include supporting authority for the recommended level of discipline under the heading "Supporting Authority."

kwiktag * 078 543 017

(Do r	not-writ	above this line.)		
(7)		o more than 30 days prior to the filing of this stipulation, Respondent has been advised in writing of any ending investigation/proceeding not resolved by this stipulation, except for criminal investigations.		
(8)	Pay 614	Payment of Disciplinary Costs—Respondent acknowledges the provisions of Bus. & Prof. Code §§6086.10 & \$140.7. (Check one option only):		
		costs added to membership fee for calendar year following effective date of discipline. costs to be paid in equal amounts prior to February 1 for the following membership years: 2010, 2011 and 2012.		
		(hardship, special circumstances or other good cause per rule 284, Rules of Procedure) costs waived in part as set forth in a separate attachment entitled "Partial Waiver of Costs" costs entirely waived		
	Profe	evating Circumstances [for definition, see Standards for Attorney Sanctions for ssional Misconduct, standard 1.2(b)]. Facts supporting aggravating circumstances equired.		
(1)		Prior record of discipline [see standard 1.2(f)]		
	(a)	State Bar Court case # of prior case		
	(b)	☐ Date prior discipline effective		
	(c)	Rules of Professional Conduct/ State Bar Act violations:		
	(d)	Degree of prior discipline		
	(e)	If Respondent has two or more incidents of prior discipline, use space provided below or a separate attachment entitled "Prior Discipline.		
(2)		Dishonesty: Respondent's misconduct was surrounded by or followed by bad faith, dishonesty, concealment, overreaching or other violations of the State Bar Act or Rules of Professional Conduct.		
(3)		Trust Violation: Trust funds or property were involved and Respondent refused or was unable to account to the client or person who was the object of the misconduct for improper conduct toward said funds or property.		
(4)		Harm: Respondent's misconduct harmed significantly a client, the public or the administration of justice.		
(5)		Indifference: Respondent demonstrated indifference toward rectification of or atonement for the consequences of his or her misconduct.		
(6)		_ack of Cooperation: Respondent displayed a lack of candor and cooperation to victims of his/her misconduct or to the State Bar during disciplinary investigation or proceedings.		
(7)		Multiple/Pattern of Misconduct: Respondent's current misconduct evidences multiple acts of wrongdoing or demonstrates a pattern of misconduct.		
(8)	\boxtimes	No aggravating circumstances are involved.		

Additional aggravating circumstances

	_	ating Circumstances [see standard 1.2(e)]. Facts supporting mitigating imstances are required.				
(1)		No Prior Discipline: Respondent has no prior record of discipline over many years of practice coupled with present misconduct which is not deemed serious.				
(2)	\boxtimes	No Harm: Respondent did not harm the client or person who was the object of the misconduct. Respondent had not previously handled a client trust account and had a mistaken belief regarding the proper use of her client trust account. No client funds were taken from the trust account.				
(3)		Candor/Cooperation: Respondent displayed spontaneous candor and cooperation with the victims of his/her misconduct and to the State Bar during disciplinary investigation and proceedings. Respondent was prompt in responding to the State Bar's investigation in this matter and readily admitted she did not handle the funds in her trust account properly.				
(4)		Remorse: Respondent promptly took objective steps spontaneously demonstrating remorse and recognition of the wrongdoing, which steps were designed to timely atone for any consequences of his/her misconduct. Respondent immediately opened an operating account to ensure that she did not deposition her personal funds in her client trust account upon being notified that she was not permitted to place personal funds in the trust account.				
(5)	· 🗀	Restitution: Respondent paid \$ on in restitution to without the threat or force of disciplinary, civil or criminal proceedings.				
(6)		Delay: These disciplinary proceedings were excessively delayed. The delay is not attributable to Respondent and the delay prejudiced him/her.				
(7)		Good Faith: Respondent acted in good faith.				
(8)		Emotional/Physical Difficulties: At the time of the stipulated act or acts of professional misconduct Respondent suffered extreme emotional difficulties or physical disabilities which expert testimony would establish was directly responsible for the misconduct. The difficulties or disabilities were not the product of any illegal conduct by the member, such as illegal drug or substance abuse, and Respondent no longer suffers from such difficulties or disabilities.				
(9)		Severe Financial Stress: At the time of the misconduct, Respondent suffered from severe financial stress which resulted from circumstances not reasonably foreseeable or which were beyond his/her control and which were directly responsible for the misconduct.				
(10)		Family Problems: At the time of the misconduct, Respondent suffered extreme difficulties in his/her personal life which were other than emotional or physical in nature.				
(11)		Good Character: Respondent's good character is attested to by a wide range of references in the legal and general communities who are aware of the full extent of his/her misconduct.				
(12)		Rehabilitation: Considerable time has passed since the acts of professional misconduct occurred followed by convincing proof of subsequent rehabilitation.				
(13)		No mitigating circumstances are involved.				
Add	itiona	al mitigating circumstances				

Respondent has no prior record of discipline. Although Respondent had not been an attorney for a lengthy period of time when the misconduct occurred so as to warrant mitigation per Std. 1.2(e)(i), it appears that Respondent's misunderstanding of the law regarding placing personal funds in her trust account was due, in part, to her inexperience. Respondent also had a mistaken, but unreasonable belief that she could deposit personal funds in her client trust account. Respondent will attend Client Trust Account School and Ethics School, which should serve to prevent such misconduct in the future.

Respondent presented the State Bar with declarations from three character witnesses who were aware of the full extent of the misconduct and who attested to her good character. While three declarations does not appear to constitute a wide range of references in the general and legal communities, such evidence is still entitled to some consideration in mitigation.

(1)	\boxtimes	Stayed Suspension: Stayed Suspension: Stayed Suspension:				
	(a)	\boxtimes	Resp	condent must be suspended from the practice of law for a period of one (1) year.		
		1.		and until Respondent shows proof satisfactory to the State Bar Court of rehabilitation and present fitness to practice and present learning and ability in the law pursuant to standard 1.4(c)(ii), Standards for Attorney Sanctions for Professional Misconduct.		
		ii.		and until Respondent pays restitution as set forth in the Financial Conditions form attached to this stipulation.		
		iii.		and until Respondent does the following:		
	The	abov	e-refe	renced suspension is stayed.		
(2)	\boxtimes	Prol	ation	:		
Respondent is placed on probation for a period of two (2) years , which will commence upon the effective of the Supreme Court order in this matter. (See rule 9.18 California Rules of Court)						
E. /	Addi	tiona	ıl Co	nditions of Probation:		
(1)	\boxtimes			probation period, Respondent must comply with the provisions of the State Bar Act and Rules of al Conduct.		
(2)		State infor	e Bar a matio	(10) days of any change, Respondent must report to the Membership Records Office of the and to the Office of Probation of the State Bar of California ("Office of Probation"), all changes of n, including current office address and telephone number, or other address for State Bar as prescribed by section 6002.1 of the Business and Professions Code.		
(3)		and cond prob	sched litions ation (by (30) days from the effective date of discipline, Respondent must contact the Office of Probation will a meeting with Respondent's assigned probation deputy to discuss these terms and of probation. Upon the direction of the Office of Probation, Respondent must meet with the deputy either in-person or by telephone. During the period of probation, Respondent must neet with the probation deputy as directed and upon request.		
(4)		July whe	10, ar ther R	nt must submit written quarterly reports to the Office of Probation on each January 10, April 10, and October 10 of the period of probation. Under penalty of perjury, Respondent must state espondent has complied with the State Bar Act, the Rules of Professional Conduct, and all of probation during the preceding calendar quarter. Respondent must also state whether there		

(Do 1	not write	e above	this line.)			
		curre	ny proceedings pending against hin ent status of that proceeding. If the fi nitted on the next quarter date, and o	irst report wo	e State Bar Court and if so, the case number and uld cover less than 30 days, that report must be ended period.	
		In ac	dition to all quarterly reports, a final ty (20) days before the last day of th	report, conta	ining the same information, is due no earlier than robation and no later than the last day of probation.	
(5)		Respondent must be assigned a probation monitor. Respondent must promptly review the terms and conditions of probation with the probation monitor to establish a manner and schedule of compliance. During the period of probation, Respondent must furnish to the monitor such reports as may be requested in addition to the quarterly reports required to be submitted to the Office of Probation. Respondent must cooperate fully with the probation monitor.				
(6)	\boxtimes	inqui direc	Subject to assertion of applicable privileges, Respondent must answer fully, promptly and truthfully any inquiries of the Office of Probation and any probation monitor assigned under these conditions which are directed to Respondent personally or in writing relating to whether Respondent is complying or has complied with the probation conditions.			
(7)	\boxtimes	Prob	n one (1) year of the effective date of ation satisfactory proof of attendanc given at the end of that session.	of the discipli e at a sessio	ne herein, Respondent must provide to the Office of n of the State Bar Ethics School, and passage of the	
			No Ethics School recommended.	Reason:		
(8)		must			ion imposed in the underlying criminal matter and in with any quarterly report to be filed with the Office	
(9)	\boxtimes	The	ollowing conditions are attached he	reto and inco	rporated:	
			Substance Abuse Conditions		Law Office Management Conditions	
			Medical Conditions		Financial Conditions	
F. (Othe	r Coi	nditions Negotiated by the P	arties:		
(1)		the Cor res	Multistate Professional Responsibilitierence of Bar Examiners, to the O	ity Examinati iffice of Proba t further hea l	ion: Respondent must provide proof of passage of on ("MPRE"), administered by the National ation within one year. Failure to pass the MPRE ring until passage. But see rule 9.10(b), California Procedure.	
			No MPRE recommended. Reason:	٠		
(2)		Oti	er Conditions:			

Attachment language (if any):

In the Matter of Chrystal Bobbitt	Case number(s): 07-0-12290	
A Member of the State Bar		
inancial Conditions		
. Restitution		•
annum) to the payee(s) lis	titution (including the principal amou ted below. If the Client Security Fur s) for all or any portion of the princip y restitution to CSF in the amount(s)	nd ("CSF") has reimbursed al amount(s) listed below,
Payee	Principal Amount	Interest Accrues From
		,
Respondent must pay abort payment to the Office of P	ve-referenced restitution and provide robation not later than	e satisfactory proof of
payment to the Office of P	robation not later than	e satisfactory proof of
payment to the Office of P Installment Restitution P Respondent must pay the below. Respondent must with each quarterly probati No later than 30 days prior	ayments above-referenced restitution on the perovide satisfactory proof of payment on report, or as otherwise directed be to the expiration of the period of prost make any necessary final payments.	payment schedule set forth t to the Office of Probation by the Office of Probation. obation (or period of
payment to the Office of P Installment Restitution P Respondent must pay the below. Respondent must with each quarterly probati No later than 30 days prior reproval), Respondent must	robation not later than ayments above-referenced restitution on the perovide satisfactory proof of paymen on report, or as otherwise directed by to the expiration of the period of prost make any necessary final payment including interest, in full.	payment schedule set forth t to the Office of Probation by the Office of Probation. obation (or period of
payment to the Office of P Installment Restitution P Respondent must pay the below. Respondent must with each quarterly probati No later than 30 days prior reproval), Respondent must the payment of restitution,	robation not later than ayments above-referenced restitution on the perovide satisfactory proof of paymen on report, or as otherwise directed by to the expiration of the period of prost make any necessary final payment including interest, in full.	payment schedule set forth It to the Office of Probation by the Office of Probation. Obation (or period of It(s) in order to complete
payment to the Office of P Installment Restitution P Respondent must pay the below. Respondent must with each quarterly probati No later than 30 days prior reproval), Respondent must the payment of restitution,	robation not later than ayments above-referenced restitution on the perovide satisfactory proof of paymen on report, or as otherwise directed by to the expiration of the period of prost make any necessary final payment including interest, in full.	payment schedule set forth It to the Office of Probation by the Office of Probation. Obation (or period of It(s) in order to complete
payment to the Office of P Installment Restitution P Respondent must pay the below. Respondent must with each quarterly probati No later than 30 days prior reproval), Respondent must the payment of restitution,	robation not later than ayments above-referenced restitution on the perovide satisfactory proof of paymen on report, or as otherwise directed by to the expiration of the period of prost make any necessary final payment including interest, in full.	payment schedule set forth It to the Office of Probation by the Office of Probation. Obation (or period of It(s) in order to complete
payment to the Office of P Installment Restitution P Respondent must pay the below. Respondent must with each quarterly probati No later than 30 days prior reproval), Respondent must the payment of restitution,	robation not later than ayments above-referenced restitution on the perovide satisfactory proof of paymen on report, or as otherwise directed by to the expiration of the period of prost make any necessary final payment including interest, in full.	payment schedule set forth It to the Office of Probation by the Office of Probation. Obation (or period of It(s) in order to complete
payment to the Office of P Installment Restitution P Respondent must pay the below. Respondent must with each quarterly probati No later than 30 days prior reproval), Respondent must the payment of restitution,	robation not later than ayments above-referenced restitution on the perovide satisfactory proof of paymen on report, or as otherwise directed by to the expiration of the period of prost make any necessary final payment including interest, in full.	payment schedule set forth t to the Office of Probation by the Office of Probation. obation (or period of it(s) in order to complete

- required quarterly report, Respondent must file with each required report a certificate from Respondent and/or a certified public accountant or other financial professional approved by the Office of Probation, certifying that:
 - Respondent has maintained a bank account in a bank authorized to do business in the State of California, at a branch located within the State of California, and that such account is designated as a "Trust Account" or "Clients' Funds Account";

- b. Respondent has kept and maintained the following:
 - i. A written ledger for each client on whose behalf funds are held that sets forth:
 - 1. the name of such client;
 - the date, amount and source of all funds received on behalf of such client:
 - 3. the date, amount, payee and purpose of each disbursement made on behalf of such client; and.
 - 4. the current balance for such client.
 - ii. a written journal for each client trust fund account that sets forth:
 - 1. the name of such account;
 - 2. the date, amount and client affected by each debit and credit; and,
 - 3. the current balance in such account.
 - iii. all bank statements and cancelled checks for each client trust account; and,
 - iv. each monthly reconciliation (balancing) of (i), (ii), and (iii), above, and if there are any differences between the monthly total balances reflected in (i), (ii), and (iii), above, the reasons for the differences.
- Respondent has maintained a written journal of securities or other properties held for clients that specifies:
- i. each item of security and property held;
- ii. the person on whose behalf the security or property is held;
- iii. the date of receipt of the security or property;
- iv. the date of distribution of the security or property; and,
- v. the person to whom the security or property was distributed.
- If Respondent does not possess any client funds, property or securities during
 the entire period covered by a report, Respondent must so state under penalty of
 perjury in the report filed with the Office of Probation for that reporting period. In
 this circumstance, Respondent need not file the accountant's certificate
 described above.
- 3. The requirements of this condition are in addition to those set forth in rule 4-100, Rules of Professional Conduct.

d. Client Trust Accounting School

Within one (1) year of the effective date of the discipline herein, Respondent must supply to the Office of Probation satisfactory proof of attendance at a session of the Ethics School Client Trust Accounting School, within the same period of time, and passage of the test given at the end of that session.

ATTACHMENT TO

STIPULATION RE FACTS, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND DISPOSITION

IN THE MATTER OF:

Chrystal L. Bobbitt

CASE NUMBER(S): ET AL.

07-O-12290

WAIVER OF VARIANCE BETWEEN NOTICE OF DISCIPLINARY CHARGES AND STIPULATED FACTS AND CULPABILITY.

The parties waive any variance between the Notice of Disciplinary Charges filed on February 5, 2009 and the facts and/or conclusions of law contained in this stipulation. Additionally, the parties waive the issuance of an amended Notice of Disciplinary Charges. The parties further waive the right to the filing of a Notice of Disciplinary Charges and to a formal hearing on any charge not included in the pending Notice of Disciplinary Charges.

FACTS AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW.

Respondent admits that the following facts are true and that she is culpable of violations of the specified statutes and/or Rules of Professional Conduct.

- 1. At all times mentioned herein, Respondent maintained a client trust account at Bank of America, Account Number XXXXX-X5400 ("Respondent's CTA").
- 2. In or about January 2007, Respondent issued two checks upon Respondent's CTA which were initially rejected by the bank based on insufficient funds, as follows:

CHECK	CHECK	DATE	BANK	ACCOUNT
NUMBER	AMOUNT	PRESENTED	<u>ACTION</u>	BALANCE
1200	\$ 148.00	6/19/07	paid on re-deposit	\$- 87.32
1065	\$1,738.98	1/23/07	returned NSF	\$-68.32

Check No. 1065 was returned as NSF and was not re-deposited. Upon notice to the Respondent by the bank that the check had been rejected, the vendor was immediately paid with a cashier's check including additional sums for inconvenience.

- 3. There were sufficient funds in the account on the date of issuance of the checks, but due to accounting error, funds were moved from the account prior to the checks clearing, thus causing the checks to be rejected when they were negotiated weeks after issuance. Respondent knew or was grossly negligent in moving funds from the account without ensuring that these two previously issued checks had cleared the account or leaving sufficient funds in the account to pay any checks that had not yet been negotiated.
- 4. During the period of in or about November 1, 2006 through January 31, 2007, Respondent issued checks for personal/ office expenses to be paid out of personal funds in the CTA as follows:

CHECK	CHECK	DATE	,
NUMBER	AMOUNT	PRESENTED	PAYEE
electronic	\$189.00	11/13/06	ComCast/Time Warner Cable
electronic	\$ 374.97	01/12/07	Barrister Executive Suites, Inc.

5. By negligently issuing the checks which were returned NSF, and by willfully leaving personal funds in Respondent's CTA for withdrawal as needed to pay personal and/or office expenses Respondent improperly used her CTA as a personal account and commingled funds belonging to Respondent in a client trust account in violation of rule 4-100(A) of the Rules of Professional Conduct. There were no client funds in the CTA at the time. All the funds in the CTA were personal funds of Respondent placed there to segregate funds so they would be available to pay a client's litigation expenses.

PENDING PROCEEDINGS.

The disclosure date referred to, on page 2, paragraph A(6), was August 17, 2009.

DISMISSALS.

The parties respectfully request the Court to dismiss the following alleged violations in the interest of justice:

Case No.	Count	Alleged Violation
07-O-12290	One	Business and Professions Code section 6106

COSTS OF DISCIPLINARY PROCEEDINGS.

Respondent acknowledges that the Office of the Chief Trial Counsel has informed respondent that as of July 23, 2009, the prosecution costs in this matter are \$4,321.92. Respondent further acknowledges that should this stipulation be rejected or should relief from the stipulation be granted, the costs in this matter may increase due to the cost of further proceedings.

AUTHORITIES SUPPORTING DISCIPLINE.

Standard 2.2(b) of the Standards for Attorney Sanctions for Professional Misconduct; *Dudugjian v. State Bar* (1991) 52 Cal.3d 1092.

(Do not write above this line.)		
In the Matter of	Case number(s):	
Chrystal Bobbitt	07-O-12290	
		·

SIGNATURE OF THE PARTIES

By their signatures below, the parties and their counsel, as applicable, signify their agreement with each of the recitations and each of the terms and conditions of this Stipulation Re Fact, Conclusions of Law and Disposition.

August 2, 2009
Date

Deputy Trial Coursel's Signature

Chrystal Bobbitt
Print Name

Fint Name

Kimberly G. Anderson
Print Name

In the Matter Chrystal Bo		Case Number(s): 07-O-12290
		ORDER
	ERED that the requested disn	arties and that it adequately protects the public, nissal of counts/charges, if any, is GRANTED without
	The stipulated facts and disp RECOMMENDED to the Su	position are APPROVED and the DISCIPLINE preme Court.
X	•	oosition are APPROVED AS MODIFIED as set forth IS RECOMMENDED to the Supreme Court.
	All Hearing dates are vacate	ed.
The Pa	costs referred to kid in equal amou hembership years	in paragraph A (8) will be into prior to February I for the acil, 2012, and 2013.
	, ,	

The parties are bound by the stipulation as approved unless: 1) a motion to withdraw or modify the stipulation, filed within 15 days after service of this order, is granted; or 2) this court modifies or further modifies the approved stipulation. (See rule 135(b), Rules of Procedure.) The effective date of this disposition is the effective date of the Supreme Court order herein, normally 30 days after file date. (See rule 9.18(a), California Rules of Court.)

9 9 09

Date

Judge of the State Bar Court

DONALD F. MILES

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

[Rule 62(b), Rules Proc.; Code Civ. Proc., § 1013a(4)]

I am a Case Administrator of the State Bar Court of California. I am over the age of eighteen and not a party to the within proceeding. Pursuant to standard court practice, in the City and County of Los Angeles, on September 14, 2009, I deposited a true copy of the following document(s):

STIPULATION RE FACTS, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND DISPOSITION AND ORDER APPROVING

in a sealed envelope for collection and mailing on that date as follows: \boxtimes by first-class mail, with postage thereon fully prepaid, through the United States Postal Service at Los Angeles, California, addressed as follows: ELLEN ANNE PANSKY PANSKY MARKLE HAM, LLP 1010 SYCAMORE AVE UNIT 308 SOUTH PASADENA CA 91030 by certified mail, No. , with return receipt requested, through the United States Postal Service at , California, addressed as follows: by overnight mail at , California, addressed as follows: by fax transmission, at fax number . No error was reported by the fax machine that I used. By personal service by leaving the documents in a sealed envelope or package clearly labeled to identify the attorney being served with a receptionist or a person having charge of the attorney's office, addressed as follows: \boxtimes by interoffice mail through a facility regularly maintained by the State Bar of California addressed as follows: KIM ANDERSON, Enforcement, Los Angeles I hereby certify that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed in Los Angeles, California, on September 14, 2009.

Angela Owens-Carpenter
Case Administrator

State Bar Court